

ACTIVITY 1.6 continued

12 RETURNING TO THE TEXT:

Guide students to return to the text to respond to the text-dependent questions. Invite them to work in small groups to reread the text and answer the questions. Remind them to use text evidence in their responses.

13 Move from group to group and listen in as students answer the text-dependent questions. If they have difficulty, scaffold the questions by rephrasing them or breaking them down into smaller parts. See the Scaffolding the Text-Dependent Questions boxes for suggestions.

14 Once students have finished reading the passage and responding to the text-dependent questions, ask them to return to their word maps for the word *conversation*. What key words or ideas might they add now? Which words are most important and why? They should also list any questions that they have about the topic.

1.6

Returning to the Text

- Reread the argument to answer these text-dependent questions.
- Write any additional questions you have about the text in your Reader/Writer Notebook.

1. What does the author suggest caused the tragedy of Air Florida Flight 90? How does she come to this conclusion?

The author suggests that the tragedy occurred because the pilots did not communicate well as the plane was being de-iced during the storm. As evidence, the author provides the transcript between the pilot and the copilot that shows the lack of communication between the two officers.

2. What is the key idea of this passage, and how does Headlee support it?

The key idea of this passage is that society needs to become better at communicating, which includes both speaking and listening. The author provides factual details regarding the crash of Air Florida Flight 90, which Headlee claims may have been prevented if the pilots had communicated better. She also provides a personal anecdote.

3. What was one of Headlee's most valuable lessons in listening? What kind of appeal does she make?

The author claims that one of the most valuable lessons was a result from her failure to listen. She then describes how France Neptune told his fiancée, Mallery Thurlow, that her godchild had died in the earthquake. The story is meant to be heartbreaking and appeals to the reader's emotions.

4. The author writes, "In my private life, I've lost contact with family members and I've seen friendships die in silence when I failed to say what was really on my mind." What is the author's purpose for including this reflection?

The author provides this reflection to connect to the reader by showing that she, too, is guilty of the offense she describes in others. Here, Headlee is acknowledging that she is not perfect, but that she is able to see the problem.

5. What do you think was Headlee's purpose in beginning with the story of Air Florida Flight 90? How does the story work with her argument throughout the text?

The author begins with the transcript to illustrate how readers interpret the event differently. While some believe that de-icing standards were to blame or that the co-pilots need training in direct communication, the author is making the point that listening effectively is a survival skill, because conflict is inevitable.

ACTIVITY 1.6 continued

19 To support students in finding fallacies in the Celeste Headlee text, divide the text and assign sections to pairs of students.

LEVELED DIFFERENTIATED INSTRUCTION

Students may benefit from support in locating and evaluating appeals to the reader.

Beginning Distribute the Idea and Argument Evaluator graphic organizer. Work with students to identify the author's argument and three ideas from the text that support it.

Developing Divide students into two groups. Ask one group to find appeals to logic and the other to find appeals to emotion. In each case, identify if the appeal is a fallacy. Have groups complete the Idea and Argument Evaluator graphic organizer for their assignment. Afterward, pair students from opposite groups and have them share their findings. Ask them which appeals they think are the strongest and why.

Expanding Provide students with two copies of the Idea and Argument Evaluator graphic organizer, one to use when evaluating appeals to logic and one to use when evaluating appeals to emotion. Have students evaluate both types of appeals. Ask students which type of appeal they think is the strongest and why.

Support As you work with students to identify the author's argument and three supporting ideas, ask them whether they think this argument is persuasive or not based on the evidence. Be sure to explain characteristics of each.

Extend Have students evaluate how the Idea and Argument Evaluator graphic organizer is designed, and what information it gives a reader.

1.6

Examples of Common Fallacies

Hasty Generalization	A conclusion that is based on insufficient or biased evidence; in other words, rushing to a conclusion before all relevant facts are available.	Example: I asked two people if they like ice cream and they both said yes. If 100% of the people I asked like ice cream, then I can assume that all people like ice cream.
Either/Or	A conclusion that oversimplifies the argument by reducing it to only two sides or choices.	Example: You're either a cat person or a dog person.
Ad Populum	An argument that concludes that a fact, position, or proposition must be true because many people believe in it.	Example: Most people disagree with this new law; therefore, it is a bad idea.
Moral Equivalence	A comparison of minor misdeeds with major atrocities.	Example: Anyone who harms an animal is worse than Hitler.
Red Herring	A diversionary tactic that avoids the key issues, often by avoiding opposing arguments rather than addressing them.	Example: I know I'm late to school, but I did well on my last test.

7. With a partner, reread the excerpt from *We Need to Talk* and look for evidence of fallacious reasoning. Provide evidence for why you think the reasoning is fallacious and discuss how the writer could have changed her text to avoid these problems.

The author makes a hasty generalization that improving conversational techniques between the pilots would have prevented the crash of Air Florida Flight 90. The writer should have used a different and more concrete example of how poor communication led to a problem. The author also creates an *either/or* fallacy by claiming that either copilots learn to be more direct with their captains, or pilots learn to listen better. The writer should have included several other options to fix the issue at hand.

 **Check Your Understanding**

What other fallacies are commonly used in arguments? With a partner, discuss the ways in which anecdotal evidence could be an example of false or fallacious reasoning.

LANGUAGE & WRITER'S CRAFT: Colons and Semicolons

Colons and semicolons are used to help organize information in sentences.

The **colon** is used to introduce a list or quotation.

- Students can bring four items to take the test: calculator, protractor, pencil, and study guide.
- The welcome mat told her everything she needed to know: "Beware of Dog."

PRACTICE Write two sentences, one that uses a colon before a list and one that uses a colon to introduce a quotation.

The **semicolon** is used to join two closely related independent clauses.

- On went her old brown jacket; on went her old brown hat.
- Jaime's favorite food is spaghetti; his father's is a juicy burger.

Similar to the word *but*, **semicolons** can be used with the word *however* as a transitional phrase.

- Jaime's favorite food is spaghetti; however, his father can't stand it.

PRACTICE Write two sentences, one that uses a semicolon to link closely related independent clauses and one that uses a semicolon before the word *however*.

 **Explain How an Author Builds an Argument**

Evaluate the claim Celeste Headlee makes about the importance of communication. Then assess the evidence she cites to support the claim and identify any logical fallacies or faulty reasoning she uses in her argument. Be sure to:

- Identify the author's main claim.
- Evaluate the various types of evidence the author provides to support the claim, including counterarguments, concessions, and rebuttals.
- Identify any logical fallacies or faulty reasoning, such as hasty generalization or either-or reasoning.
- Use semicolons and colons correctly and effectively.

**EXPLAIN HOW AN AUTHOR BUILDS AN ARGUMENT**

The following standards are addressed in the writing prompt:

- W.9-10.2a
- W.9-10.2b
- W.9-10.2b
- L.9-10.2a, L.9-10.2b

ACTIVITY 1.6 continued

20 Discuss why writers might purposely incorporate fallacies into their writing. Then have students respond to the Check Your Understanding question, either individually or with partners.

21 Read and discuss the Language & Writer's Craft instruction about semicolons with students.

SAT® CONNECTIONS

This activity provides practice with the following important SAT skill: explaining how an author builds an argument to persuade an audience.

22 Review the Explaining How an Author Builds an Argument Writing Prompt. Have students respond individually to the writing prompt.

ASSESS

Provide an example of an argument that uses anecdotal evidence. Make sure that students are able to correctly identify the argument and the anecdotal evidence. Circulate during students' Check Your Understanding discussions to ensure that they are able to identify potential bias as an element of anecdotal evidence.

Review students' evaluations of Headlee's argument. Check that students have identified the author's claim and the types of evidence she uses to support that claim. Are they also able to successfully identify logical fallacies?

ADAPT

To support students in identifying fallacies and fallacious reasoning, return to the Examples of Common Fallacies chart and discuss each definition and example in more detail. Offer students additional, everyday examples of each type of fallacy. For example, a hasty generalization might be deciding that one dislikes vegetables after tasting only broccoli.