Framing the Investigation

Learning Targets

- Investigate how critical lenses can both shape and reveal perspectives about real-world events and issues.
- Use different critical lenses to compose research questions.
- Ask questions to evaluate the effectiveness of structural characteristics in nonfiction texts related to the same topic.

Preview

In this activity, you will begin exploring the ways the media, public figures, and government organizations shape or construct the meaning of a historical event: Hurricane Katrina. You will start by reading several texts that help frame and contextualize the event.

As You Read

- Put a star next to actions Congress will take and put a dash next to actions Congress expects individuals, state governments, and local governments to take. E4.4(G), E4.5(E)
- Circle unknown words and phrases, including legal language used in the document. Use an online or print dictionary to define them and make notes as needed. E4.2(A), E4.4(I)

E4.4(D) Critique and evaluate how the author’s use of language informs and shapes the perception of readers.

Focus Standards:

E4.4(B) Generate questions about text before, during, and after reading to deepen understanding and gain information.
E4.8(D) Critique and evaluate how the author’s use of language informs and shapes the perception of readers.
E4.8(G) Analyze the effects of rhetorical devices and logical fallacies on the way the text is read and understood.
E4.11(A) Develop questions for formal and informal inquiry.

Law

The Robert T. Stafford Disaster Relief and Emergency Assistance Act, Section 101

Sec. 101. Congressional Findings and Declarations (42 U.S.C. 5121)

a. The Congress hereby finds and declares that

1. because disasters often cause loss of life, human suffering, loss of income, and property loss and damage; and

2. because disasters often disrupt the normal functioning of governments and communities, and adversely affect individuals and families with great severity; special measures, designed to assist the efforts of the affected States in expediting the rendering of aid, assistance, and emergency services, and the reconstruction and rehabilitation of devastated areas, are necessary.

INDEPENDENT READING LINK

Read and Connect

Much has been written about Hurricane Katrina and its massive effects on the people, environment, government, and history of the Gulf region. Find and read an informational or fiction text about Hurricane Katrina that interests you, taking notes as you read it to help you develop contextual understandings about the event. Record your notes in your Reader/Writer Notebook.

Discussion Groups
Marking the Text
Note-taking
Quickwrite
Think-Pair-Share

My Notes

ACTIVITY 4.5

PLAN

Suggested Pacing: 2 50-minute class periods

TEACH

1. Read aloud the Learning Targets and Preview. You may want to discuss with the class how you define “public figure” for the purposes of this unit.

2. Write the following quote from Willa Cather on the board: “There are some things you learn best in calm, and some in storm.” In a quickwrite, ask students to respond to this quote. Then discuss their responses.

3. Remind students to complete the Independent Reading Link. Help them find texts about Hurricane Katrina online or in your school’s media center. Several titles included in this unit’s Planning the Unit section relate to Hurricane Katrina. You may want to extend the scope for independent reading topics to include other recent natural disasters that have impacted the United States.

4. Explain to students that in the next few activities, which are designed to help prepare them for Embedded Assessment 1, they will be investigating the various issues surrounding Hurricane Katrina, the 2005 storm that devastated much of the Gulf Coast. The first text they will read is one part of a longer legal document that formally established the government’s responsibilities in addressing natural disasters such as hurricanes.

5. Read the As You Read bullets with your students. Help them understand the instructions for annotation and preview the structure of the text. Explain why there is no About the Author feature for this text.

6. FIRST READ: This is a brief passage that is already chunked, so it may be a good opportunity for students to practice reading independently.

TEXT COMPLEXITY

Overall: Moderate
Lexile: 1440L
Qualitative: Moderate Difficulty
Task: Accessible (Understand)
b. It is the intent of the Congress, by this Act, to provide an orderly and continuing means of assistance by the Federal Government to State and local governments in carrying out their responsibilities to alleviate the suffering and damage which result from such disasters by
3. revising and broadening the scope of existing disaster relief programs;
4. encouraging the development of comprehensive disaster preparedness and assistance plans, programs, capabilities, and organizations by the States and by local governments;
5. achieving greater coordination and responsiveness of disaster preparedness and relief programs;
6. encouraging individuals, States, and local governments to protect themselves by obtaining insurance coverage to supplement or replace governmental assistance;
7. encouraging hazard mitigation measures to reduce losses from disasters, including development of land use and construction regulations; and
(6) providing Federal assistance programs for both public and private losses sustained in disasters.

Making Observations
• What stands out about the document’s structure?
• What are your initial thoughts on Congress’s plan?

Scaffolding the Text-Dependent Questions
1. According to this document, why and how does the federal government step in to assist state and local governments in the event of a disaster? Look for the words governments and communities. Why is federal assistance “necessary”?
2. What is the primary purpose of this document? Who is its intended audience? What does the document’s title tell you about its purpose? Who or what receives “assistance” under the document’s provisions?
3. According to subsection (b), what is the government’s responsibility in times of disaster? Look for the word responsibilities in subsection (b).
4. How do subsections (a) and (b) differ in purpose? How effective is it to use these text features? Explain your response. Reread the introductions for each subsection and use what you know about outlining to address this question.
Returning to the Text

- Reread the legal document to answer these text-dependent questions.
- Write any additional questions you have about the text in your Reader/Writer Notebook.

1. According to this document, why and how does the federal government step in to assist state and local governments in the event of a disaster?

   Disasters cause hardships to individuals and families and disrupt normal state and local government functions. The federal government steps in to help provide “aid, assistance, and emergency services, and the reconstruction and rehabilitation of devastated areas” in a timely way. E4.4(G)

2. What is the primary purpose of this document? Who is the intended audience?

   This document offers state and local governments an overview of the role the federal government will play in helping deal with a disaster and aid they will provide during a disaster. Given this context, it can be inferred that the most frequent audience would be federal, state, and local government officials. E4.4(F), E4.8(A)

3. According to subsection (b), what is the government’s responsibility in times of disaster?

   The government’s responsibility is to “alleviate the suffering and damage” caused by disasters. E4.4(G) E4.5(D)

4. How do subsections (a) and (b) differ in purpose? How effective is it to use these text features? Explain your response.

   Subsection (a) states that special measures are necessary in times of disaster, while subsection (b) states Congress’s intent to provide federal aid to state and local governments in times of disaster and how it will do so. Defined sections make the information very clear and show that this text has a functional and legal purpose. E4.7(D)(ii), E4.8(B)

As You Read

- As you read “Daylong Efforts to Repair Levee Fail” on the next page, underline words and phrases that help you visualize the scene. E4.4(D), E4.5(E)
- Circle unknown words. Use a print resources or an online thesaurus to find synonyms to strengthen your understanding. E4.2(A), E4.4(I)
- Consult the footnotes and use an online or print map to locate the areas mentioned in the passage. E4.4(I)
Daylong Efforts to Repair Levee Fail

by Dan Shea
The Times-Picayune, August 31, 2005

1 New Orleans became an unimaginable scene of water, fear and suffering Tuesday after a levee breach in the 17th Street Canal sent billions of gallons of Lake Pontchartrain coursing through the city.

2 As the day wore on, the only dry land was a narrow band from the French Quarter and parts of Uptown, the same small strip that was settled by Bienville amid the swamps.

3 On Tuesday night, it appeared the city was returning to swamp when a daylong effort to shore the levee near the Hammond Highway failed. Mayor Ray Nagin said pumps were being overwhelmed and warned that a new deluge would bury the city in up to 15 feet of water.

4 With solid water from the lake to the French Quarter, the inundation and depopulation of an entire American city was at hand.

5 "Truth to tell, we're not too far from filling in the bowl," said Terry Ebbert, the city's director of homeland security. The waters were still rising at 3 inches per hour, and eventually could move close to the French Quarter levee.

6 Although the breach occurred on the Orleans side of the canal, it did not spare the Jefferson side. Water found its way into much of the east bank, meeting the flow that came in from the west from Hurricane Katrina's storm surge Monday.

---

1 The French Quarter is New Orleans's oldest neighborhood.
2 Jean-Baptiste Le Moyne de Bienville was governor of Louisiana and founder of New Orleans.
An accurate tally of death was hard to determine. Five deaths related to Katrina have been confirmed in Jefferson Parish, officials said. There also are seven people missing who decided to ride out Katrina on Grand Isle.

As to the living, with the absence of cars and electric motors in the powerless city, a sad tableau played itself out in an eerie quiet.

All day, a weary army of storm victims trudged through waist-deep muddy water toward the Superdome, where more than 20,000 people took refuge. The next problem is what to do with them. Late Tuesday Gov. Blanco ordered them out, saying the facility was too damaged to house people and the atmosphere too dangerous. Officials said the National Guard soon would begin driving them out to dry ground, then airlift them out of southeast Louisiana.

In other areas, lawlessness took hold.

The giant new Wal-Mart in the Lower Garden District was looted, after a limited distribution of supplies broke down in chaos. The entire gun collection was taken.

“There are gangs of armed men in the city moving around the city,” Ebbert said.

One looter shot a New Orleans police officer, who was in critical condition with a head wound.

Although local police focused solely on rescue, a call for help was answered by swarms of deputies from western Louisiana parishes.

But cops on the street, cut off from their superiors by a failure of the communications system, complained of chaos.

“Put this in your paper,” one officer on Canal Street said. “They told us nothing. We were unprepared. We are completely on our own.”

If it wasn’t coordinated, the rescue was heroic.

Firefighters, police and Coast Guardsmen waded through water and climbed to roofs.

“We’ve got boats everywhere,” said Capt. Tim Bayard of the New Orleans Police Department. “We’re going to try and get who we can get and take them to higher ground. We may have to come back for some.”

They were joined by an armada of Louisiana sportsmen in flat-bottomed boats, who responded to an appeal for help.

Ferdinand Emory rescued about 100 people, ten at a time in his boat.

Ebbert estimated 1,500 to 2,000 people were saved in Lakeview and Mid-City.

Scaffolding the Text-Dependent Questions

6. What is the implied connection between the events in paragraphs 11 and 12? Reread both paragraphs. What happened at the new Wal-Mart? What was happening in the city? What connection is unspoken between the two occurrences?

7. Summarize paragraphs 10–16. Whom does the officer blame for the chaotic rescue effort? Use details to support your inference. Reread paragraphs 15 and 16. Who are the “they” to whom the officer refers? Why does he feel that he and fellow officers are on their own?
4.5

My Notes

23 But rescue from the water didn’t mean an end to misery. They were simply dropped off at the few stretches of dry ground, overpasses and parking lots along Metairie Ridge.

24 Aleck Scallan, 63, a paraplegic, was ferried in a boat from his Lakeview home. But he had been sitting for more than six hours on an overpass, with no clear indication when he and scores of others would be picked up.

25 Along the Metairie Road railroad embankment, the only passage through two parishes, people wandered aimlessly, along with dogs and cats that headed for high ground.

26 After the rescue effort, the next priority is trying to heal the breach. Ebert said plans called for giant panels to be dropped in place by helicopter, accompanied by 50, 3,000-pound sandbags. Next the Interstate 10 underpass under the railroad trestle would have to be drained, after the giant new pumping station utterly failed its first test. That would give disaster recovery teams open access to the city from the west.

27 The failure of the Industrial Canal levee created massive flooding in St. Bernard and the 9th Ward on Monday.

28 Estimates on when the city would become habitable again ranged from two weeks to months.

Making Observations

• What images come to mind while reading this article?
• What emotions do you feel after reading this article?

4 The Ninth Ward is the largest of 17 wards, or areas, into which New Orleans is divided.

Scaffolding the Text-Dependent Questions

8. Why do Aleck Scallan and others have no idea when they will be picked up from the overpass? What is the first priority of local police? Are Scallan and those with him safe on the overpass?
Returning to the Text

- Reread the article to answer these text-dependent questions.
- Write any additional questions you have about the text in your Reader/Writer Notebook.

5. Which major levee breach is the focus of this article? At the time of printing, what were the plans for repairing it? How will this help rescue efforts?

   The article focuses on the levee breach in the 17th Street Canal. Officials plan to drop giant panels and sandbags and to drain the Interstate 10 underpass. Repairing the breach will allow recovery teams into the area, but only after rescue efforts are over. E4.4(G)

6. What is the implied connection between the events in paragraphs 11 and 12?

   The writer implies that the armed men of paragraph 11 are the looters who stole the guns from the Walmart in paragraph 12 or that looters in general were stealing guns to arm themselves. E4.4(F)

7. Whom does the officer blame for the chaotic rescue effort in paragraph 16? Use details to support your inference.

   In paragraph 16, the officer says, “They told us nothing … We are completely on our own.” It can be inferred that he is referring to his superiors, because the paragraph above states that “cops on the streets” were “cut off from their superiors.” E4.4(F), E4.5(D)

8. Why do Aleck Scallan and others have no idea when they will be picked up from the overpass?

   Earlier paragraphs say that local police are focused solely on rescuing people stuck in the flood by dropping them on dry land. Because Scallan and others are now on dry land, they are considered safe and are less of a priority than people in immediate need of rescue. Also, the article states breach repair will be another key focus of first responders. E4.5(C), E4.5(D)

As You Read

- Highlight the numbers President Bush gives in the speech on the following pages. Try to picture the volume of people and supplies he outlines. E4.4(D), E4.5(E)
- Underline the priorities that President Bush mentions in his speech. E4.4(G), E4.8(B)
George W. Bush (b. 1946) was the 43rd president of the United States. Before becoming president, Bush served as governor of Texas from 1995–2000. His presidency was shaped by the terrorist attacks on September 11, 2001, which occurred eight months into his presidency. After his presidency, Bush founded the George W. Bush Presidential Center in Dallas, Texas, and created a collection of paintings, Portraits of Courage: A Commander in Chief’s Tribute to America’s Warriors, to honor American veterans.

Speech

President Outlines Hurricane Katrina Relief Efforts

by President George W. Bush

August 31, 2005

I’ve just received an update from Secretary Chertoff and other Cabinet Secretaries involved on the latest developments in Louisiana, Mississippi, and Alabama. As we flew here today, I also asked the pilot to fly over the Gulf Coast region so I could see firsthand the scope and magnitude of the devastation.

The vast majority of New Orleans, Louisiana, is under water. Tens of thousands of homes and businesses are beyond repair. A lot of the Mississippi Gulf Coast has been completely destroyed. Mobile is flooded. We are dealing with one of the worst natural disasters in our nation’s history.

And that’s why I’ve called the Cabinet together. The people in the affected regions expect the federal government to work with the state government and local government with an effective response. I have directed Secretary of Homeland Security Mike Chertoff to chair a Cabinet-level task force to coordinate all our assistance from Washington. FEMA’s Director Mike Brown is in charge of all federal response and recovery efforts in the field. I’ve instructed them to work closely with state and local officials, as well as with the private sector, to ensure that we’re helping, not hindering, recovery efforts. This recovery will take a long time. This recovery will take years.

Our efforts are now focused on three priorities: Our first priority is to save lives. We’re assisting local officials in New Orleans in evacuating any remaining citizens from the affected area. I want to thank the state of Texas, and particularly Harris County and the city of Houston and officials with the

1 The acronym FEMA stands for Federal Emergency Management Agency.

Scaffolding the Text-Dependent Questions

9. Based on details in the text, infer the rhetorical context of this speech. Reread paragraphs 1–3. Where is President Bush? To whom is he speaking? What does he want to tell them?

10. According to President Bush, what are the federal government’s three priorities? How would you categorize them? Review paragraphs 4, 8, and 10. Which priorities does he list? What examples does he give? Who or what does each priority help?
Houston Astrodome, for providing shelter to those citizens who found refuge in the Super Dome in Louisiana. Buses are on the way to take those people from New Orleans to Houston.

5. FEMA has deployed more than 50 disaster medical assistance teams from all across the country to help the affected—to help those in the affected areas. FEMA has deployed more than 25 urban search and rescue teams with more than a thousand personnel to help save as many lives as possible. The United States Coast Guard is conducting search and rescue missions. They're working alongside local officials, local assets. The Coast Guard has rescued nearly 2,000 people to date.

6. The Department of Defense is deploying major assets to the region. These include the USS Bataan to conduct search and rescue missions; eight swift water rescue teams; the Iwo Jima Amphibious Readiness Group to help with disaster response equipment; and the hospital ship USNS Comfort to help provide medical care.

7. The National Guard has nearly 11,000 Guardsmen on state active duty to assist governors and local officials with security and disaster response efforts. FEMA and the Army Corps of Engineers are working around the clock with Louisiana officials to repair the breaches in the levees so we can stop the flooding in New Orleans.

8. Our second priority is to sustain lives by ensuring adequate food, water, shelter and medical supplies for survivors and dedicated citizens—dislocated citizens. FEMA is moving supplies and equipment into the hardest hit areas. The Department of Transportation has provided more than 400 trucks to move 1,000 truckloads containing 5.4 million Meals Ready to Eat—or MREs, 13.4 million liters of water, 10,400 tarps, 3.4 million pounds of ice, 144 generators, 20 containers of pre-positioned disaster supplies, 135,000 blankets and 11,000 cots. And we're just starting.

9. There are more than 78,000 people now in shelters. HHS and CDC are working with local officials to identify operating hospital facilities so we can help them, help the nurses and doctors provide necessary medical care. They're distributing medical supplies, and they're executing a public health plan to control disease and other health-related issues that might arise.

10. Our third priority is executing a comprehensive recovery effort. We're focusing on restoring power and lines of communication that have been knocked out during the storm. We'll be repairing major roads and bridges and other essential means of transportation as quickly as possible.

Scaffolding the Text-Dependent Questions

11. What does President Bush mean by major assets in paragraph 6? What examples does he provide? What are assets? What types of assets would the Department of Defense have? Look at the examples.
There’s a lot of work we’re going to have to do. In my flyover, I saw a lot of destruction on major infrastructure. Repairing the infrastructure, of course, is going to be a key priority.

The Department of Energy is approving loans from the Strategic Petroleum Reserve to limit disruptions in crude supplies for refineries. A lot of crude production has been shut down because of the storm. I instructed Secretary Bodman to work with refiners, people who need crude oil, to alleviate any shortage through loans. The Environmental Protection Agency has granted a nationwide waiver for fuel blends to make more gasoline and diesel fuel available throughout the country. This will help take some pressure off of gas price. But our citizens must understand this storm has disrupted the capacity to make gasoline and distribute gasoline.

We’re also developing a comprehensive plan to immediately help displaced citizens. This will include housing and education and health care and other essential needs. I’ve directed the folks in my Cabinet to work with local folks, local officials, to develop a comprehensive strategy to rebuild the communities affected. And there’s going to be a lot of rebuilding done. I can’t tell you how devastating the sights were.

I want to thank the communities in surrounding states that have welcomed their neighbors during an hour of need. A lot of folks left the affected areas and found refuge with a relative or a friend, and I appreciate you doing that. I also want to thank the American Red Cross and the Salvation Army and the Catholic Charities, and all other members of the armies of compassion. I think the folks in the affected areas are going to be overwhelmed when they realize how many Americans want to help them.

The folks on the Gulf Coast are going to need the help of this country for a long time. This is going to be a difficult road. The challenges that we face on the ground are unprecedented. But there’s no doubt in my mind we’re going to succeed. Right now the days seem awfully dark for those affected—I understand that. But I’m confident that, with time, you can get your life back in order, new communities will flourish, the great city of New Orleans will be back on its feet, and America will be a stronger place for it.

**Making Observations**

- What details from this speech stand out to you?
- What are your thoughts on the priorities that the president lays out in his speech?

**Scaffolding the Text-Dependent Questions**

12. What does President Bush compare charitable relief agencies to in paragraph 14? How might this comparison appeal to his audience? What are the “armies of compassion”? What positive connotations might the words *armies* and *compassion* have for listeners?

13. How does President Bush structure paragraph 15 to appeal to his audience? Reread paragraph 15. Look closely at each sentence. Notice the sentences that begin with the transition word *but*. How do these sentences contrast with the sentences that come before them? What effect does this contrast create?
**Returning to the Text**

- Reread the speech to answer these text-dependent questions.
- Write any additional questions you have about the text in your Reader/Writer Notebook.

9. Based on details in the text, infer the purpose, occasion, and intended audience of this speech.

   The president seems to be addressing the public relatively soon after Hurricane Katrina, based on the fact that he says he recently flew over the affected area. His purpose is to inform the public of the government’s planned response to the disaster and to reassure the public. E4.4(A), E4.8(A)

10. According to President Bush, what are the federal government’s three priorities? How would you categorize them?

   The three priorities are “to save lives” through search and rescue; “to sustain lives” by providing necessities; and “executing a comprehensive recovery effort” to restore and rebuild the area. The first two priorities deal with helping people; the third deals primarily with logistics. E4.4(G), E4.5(D)

11. What does President Bush mean by major assets in paragraph 6? What examples does he provide?

   He means military equipment and personnel, including “the USS Bataan …; eight swift water rescue teams; the Iwo Jima Amphibious Readiness Group …; and the hospital ship USNS Comfort.” E4.2(B), E4.4(F)

12. What does President Bush compare charitable relief agencies to in paragraph 14? How might this comparison appeal to his audience?

   Bush calls relief agencies “the armies of compassion.” This draws a figurative comparison to actual armies. This might appeal to his target audience because armies connote strength and large numbers of well-organized soldiers working toward a goal. E4.5(C), E4.5(D), E4.8(F)

13. How does President Bush structure paragraph 15 to appeal to his audience?

   Bush first acknowledges the audience’s fears and then offers hope. For example, the first three sentences are somber, stressing the difficult recovery ahead. The fourth sentence starts with “But” to counter negative opinions. Next, he says that “the days seem awfully dark” and then follows it with another but sentence—stressing his confidence in the future. E4.8(B), E4.8(D)

**ACTIVITY 4.5 continued**

23 **RETURNING TO THE TEXT:** Have students answer the text-dependent questions independently. If students have difficulty, scaffold the questions by rephrasing them or breaking them down into smaller parts. See the Scaffolding the Text-Dependent Questions boxes for suggestions.

24 **After students have read all three texts and answered the text-dependent questions, lead a brief discussion about the connections apparent among the three texts. Guide students to consider the different function of each text and how its purpose may affect the choice of language and structure.**
4.5 Working from the Text

14. Based on the texts that you’ve read, respond to the essential question: How do media sources influence our understanding of the truth and significance of an issue?

15. Revisit either the news article “Daylong Efforts to Repair Levee Fail” or President Bush’s Rose Garden address. Briefly annotate the text one of the critical lenses (historical, cultural or Cultural) you have studied. Then use the following questions to analyze how the lenses might connect to bias in the text:
   - What is being reported (the who, what, where, when, why, and how of the event)?
   - How is it being reported? How objective is the coverage? Identify textual details (slanters, titles, labeling, omission, etc.) that reveal bias.
   - Who is the target audience for the publication/broadcast? How does the text’s rhetorical context affect what it talks about and its language and tone? What inferences can you draw about the writer or speaker’s expectations about the audience’s perspective? What evidence supports your understanding?
   - If you read only this article or heard only this speech or article, what would you think were the key issues of Hurricane Katrina? How does the text frame the truth and significance of the event?
   - What critical lens or lenses can be seen in how the text approaches the issue? What specific language reveals the lens(es)?

Guiding Questions

16. Guiding questions are questions that you can research in order to learn more about a facet of a topic or the topic as a whole. When you are creating a research plan, your guiding questions should be:
   - focused enough that it is possible for you to search for, gather, and analyze information that will give you new knowledge about a topic
   - significant enough to have been addressed in reputable research materials
   - complex enough to require in-depth research and analysis

As you begin to write guiding questions, keep this criteria in mind. If your initial guiding questions do not meet this criteria consider modifying them.
17. Use guiding questions to focus your investigation into Hurricane Katrina. The following steps will help you sharpen or refocus your guiding questions:

- Review your understanding of the critical perspectives (archetypal, cultural, feminist, historical, Marxist, reader-response). Which ones seem relevant to this topic? Why? Which ones do not? Why not?

Cultural and Historical Criticism seem central to the issue because the hurricane had major, lasting effects on the people of the region and the United States more broadly. An individual's experience of the event may have been affected by his or her status within the broader culture.

Archetypal Criticism might be relevant if the event is reported with typical story patterns (e.g., humans versus nature) or character types (e.g., the hero).

Marxist Criticism may be relevant because the event had an economic impact on people in the region and on gas prices across the country. Issues of class and economic power might play a role.

Feminist Criticism doesn't seem to be as relevant because the issue doesn't seem to involve gender issues specifically.

- Based on background knowledge and your preliminary investigation of the topic, brainstorm connections between each relevant lens and the topic.

Cultural: dominant groups and marginalized groups had different experiences of the storm; people’s views on the responsibilities of local and federal government vary depending on their political ideologies; international vs. American perspectives on the event

Historical: Katrina was one of the most devastating natural disasters to occur in US history; lessons learned (or not learned) from previous hurricanes; conflicts taking place outside of the country at the same time; evolving perspective on Bush and criticism of his responses to national crises

Marxist: gas prices shot up in the days immediately after the storm; emergency loans to keep refineries running despite disruption to crude oil supplies; economic impact of recovery; connection between residents' class status and their experience before, during, and after storm

Archetypal: humans versus nature; the hero; mass exodus

28. Assign partners to think-pair-share as they work through the questions and brainstorming exercise in student step 17. Then have pairs report their observations to the rest of the class.

LEVELED DIFFERENTIATED INSTRUCTION

In this activity, students might need support completing a quickwrite to confirm their understanding of critical lenses.

INT Have small groups complete the Conversation for Quickwrite graphic organizer to identify key words to help them explain which elements from the event can be described using Historical Criticism.

ADV Have student partners restate the prompt in their own words and then choose a critical lens to focus on. Provide the Conversation for Quickwrite graphic organizer to help them generate and explain their ideas about what parts of the event are most relevant to that lens.

ADV+ Have students work independently to respond to the quickwrite prompt. Encourage them to include a brief explanation of why they chose the lens they did.
ACTIVITY 4.5 continued

29 Using the observations of the pairs of students, lead the class through the process of generating guiding questions for further investigation of Hurricane Katrina’s media coverage. If necessary, help students choose the best sentence stem to use to turn their yes/no question into an open-ended question. You may also wish to model the process using one or two example yes/no questions.

30 Ask students to respond to the Check Your Understanding individually.

ASSESS

Review student responses to the Check Your Understanding. Assess students’ ability to cite specific elements of the story and offer a convincing rationale for why they are relevant to the lens they have chosen.

ADAPT

If students need additional help choosing a critical lens that relates to the event, review the types of lenses. Model relating one lens to the event. Then prompt student thinking using another lens before having them continue.

18. Draft an initial closed (yes/no) question linking the lens to the subject.

Was the response so slow because so many of the affected residents were poor? Was the economic impact on the country’s oil supply prioritized over the human impact? Were the people who looted stores after the storm villains?

19. Modify the question to make it open-ended by using one of the following stems:

• To what extent did X influence Y?

To what extent did residents’ economic status influence their experience of the hurricane?

• In what ways did …?

In what ways did race play a role in the media coverage of the event?

• What does the controversy surrounding (this topic) reveal about attitudes toward the (underlying issue)?

What does the controversy surrounding the response to Hurricane Katrina reveal about attitudes toward the role of government in individuals’ lives?

• What recurring story patterns are evoked by …?

What recurring story patterns, characters, and images are evoked by what happened before, during, and after the storm?

Check Your Understanding

Quickwrite: Choose a lens you think applies to the event and briefly explain what elements of the story may be most relevant through this lens.