

# Framing the Investigation

### Learning Targets

- Investigate how critical lenses can both shape and reveal perspectives about real-world events and issues.
- Use different critical lenses to frame research questions.
- Ask questions to evaluate the effectiveness of structural characteristics in nonfiction texts related to the same topic.

### Preview

In this activity, you will begin exploring the ways the media, public figures, and government organizations shape or construct the meaning of a historical event: Hurricane Katrina. You will start by reading several texts that help frame and contextualize the event.

### As You Read

- Put a star next to actions Congress will take and put a dash next to actions Congress expects individuals, state governments, and local governments to take.
- Circle unknown words and phrases, including legal language used in the document. Try to determine the meaning of the words by using context clues, word parts, or a dictionary.

### Law

# The Robert T. Stafford Disaster Relief and Emergency Assistance Act, Section 101

**Sec. 101.** Congressional Findings and Declarations (42 U.S.C. 5121)

- a. The Congress hereby finds and declares that
  1. because disasters often cause loss of life, human suffering, loss of income, and property loss and damage; and
  2. because disasters often disrupt the normal functioning of governments and communities, and adversely affect individuals and families with great severity; special measures, designed to assist the efforts of the affected States in expediting the rendering of aid, assistance, and emergency services, and the reconstruction and rehabilitation of devastated areas, are necessary.

### Learning Strategies

- Discussion Groups
- Marking the Text
- Note-taking
- Quickwrite
- Think-Pair-Share

### My Notes

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

### INDEPENDENT READING LINK

**Read and Connect**

Much has been written about Hurricane Katrina and its massive effects on the people, environment, government, and history of the Gulf Region. Find and read an informational or fiction text about Hurricane Katrina that interests you. Take notes as you read it to help you develop contextual understandings about the event. Record your notes in your Reader/Writer Notebook.

## College and Career Readiness Standards

### Focus Standards:

**RI.11–12.2** Determine two or more central ideas of a text and analyze their development over the course of the text, including how they interact and build on one another to provide a complex analysis; provide an objective summary of the text.

**RI.11–12.5** Analyze and evaluate the effectiveness of the structure an author uses in his or her exposition or argument, including whether the structure makes points clear, convincing, and engaging.

### TEXT COMPLEXITY

- Overall:** Moderate
- Lexile:** 1440L
- Qualitative:** Moderate Difficulty
- Task:** Accessible (Understand)

**PLAN**

**Suggested Pacing:** 2 50-minute class periods

### TEACH

- 1** Read aloud the Learning Targets and Preview. You may want to discuss with the class how you define *public figure* for the purposes of this unit.
- 2** Write the following quote from Willa Cather on the board: “There are some things you learn best in calm, and some in storm.” In a **quickwrite**, ask students to respond to this quote. Then discuss their responses.
- 3** Remind students to complete the Independent Reading Link. Help them find texts about Hurricane Katrina online or in your school’s media center. Several titles included in this unit’s Planning the Unit section relate to Hurricane Katrina. You may want to extend it to include reading about other recent natural disasters that have impacted the U.S.
- 4** Explain to students that in the next few activities, which are designed to help prepare them for Embedded Assessment 1, they will be investigating the various issues surrounding Hurricane Katrina, the 2005 storm that devastated much of the Gulf Coast. The first text they will read is one part of a longer legal document that formally established the government’s responsibilities in addressing natural disasters like hurricanes.
- 5** Read the As You Read section with your students. Help them understand the instructions for annotation and preview the structure of the text.
- 6 FIRST READ:** This is a brief passage that is already chunked, so it may be a good opportunity for students to practice reading independently.



### Returning to the Text

- Reread the legal document to answer these text-dependent questions.
  - Write any additional questions you have about the text in your Reader/Writer Notebook.
1. According to this document, why and how does the federal government step in to assist state and local governments in the event of a disaster?  
Disasters cause hardships to individuals and families and disrupt normal state and local government functions. The federal government steps in to help provide “aid, assistance, and emergency services, and the reconstruction and rehabilitation of devastated areas” in a timely way.
  2. What is the primary purpose of this document? Who is the intended audience?  
This document offers state and local governments an overview of the role the federal government will play in helping deal with a disaster and the type of aid the federal government will provide during a disaster. Given this context, it can be inferred that the most likely audience would be federal, state, and local government officials.
  3. According to subsection (b), what is the government’s responsibility in times of disaster?  
The government’s responsibility is to “alleviate the suffering and damage” caused by disasters.
  4. How do subsections (a) and (b) differ in purpose? What is the overall effect of using these text features?  
Subsection (a) states that special measures are necessary in times of disaster, while subsection (b) states the Congress’s intent to provide federal aid to state and local governments in times of disaster and how it will do so. Clearly defined sections show that this text has a functional and legal purpose.

### As You Read

- As you read “Day Long Efforts to Repair Levee Fail,” underline words and phrases that help you visualize the scene.
- Circle unknown words and phrases. Try to determine the meaning of the words by using context clues, word parts, or a dictionary.

**9 RETURNING TO THE TEXT:** Have students answer the text-dependent questions in small groups. If they have difficulty, scaffold the questions by rephrasing them or breaking them down into smaller parts. See the Scaffolding the Text-Dependent Questions boxes for suggestions.

**10** As students move to the next text, explain that it is a front-page news article from *The Times-Picayune*, a prominent newspaper in New Orleans. It was published two days after Hurricane Katrina came ashore in Plaquemines Parish, Louisiana, approximately 70 miles from New Orleans.



### TEACHER TO TEACHER

You may want to display *The Times-Picayune’s* website and share some information about the publication.

### Scaffolding the Text-Dependent Questions

1. **According to this document, why and how does the federal government step in to assist state and local governments in the event of a disaster?** Look for the words “governments and communities.” Why is federal assistance “necessary”? [RI.11–12.2](#)
2. **What is the primary purpose of this document? Who is its intended audience?** What does the document’s title tell you about its purpose? Who or what receives “assistance” under the document’s provisions? [RI.11–12.6](#)
3. **According to subsection (b), what is the government’s responsibility in times of disaster?** Look for the word “responsibilities” in subsection (b). [RI.11–12.2](#)
4. **How do subsections (a) and (b) differ in purpose? What is the overall effect of using these text features?** Reread the introductions for each subsection and use what you know about outlining to address this question. [RI.11–12.5](#)

## ACTIVITY 4.5 continued

**11** Read the As You Read and About the Author sections with your students. Help them understand the instructions for annotation for the next text they will read. You may want to share the website for *The Advocate* and explain that although that newspaper is based in Baton Rouge it is a competitor of *The Times-Picayune*.

**12 Vocabulary Development:** Discuss the Word Connections with students. Ask students how the words are similar in the meaning, based on the word *lever*.

**13 FIRST READ:** Have students read the article in pairs and **think-pair-share** to discuss their responses to the Making Observation questions and point out details their partner may have missed.

### TEXT COMPLEXITY

**Overall:** Accessible

**Lexile:** 1130L

**Qualitative:** Moderate Difficulty

**Task:** Moderate (Analyze)

**14** As students are reading, monitor their progress. Be sure they are engaged with the text and underlining phrases that help them visualize the scene.

## 4.5

### WORD CONNECTIONS

**Etymology**  
**Levee** is a noun derived from the French word *lever*, “to raise.” A levee is a wall or raised ridge of soil alongside a river, built to prevent flooding. Other words derived from the word *lever* include alleviate, elevate, elevator, leverage, levity, and relieve.

### My Notes

### About the Author



Dan Shea (b. 1963) is the publisher of *The Advocate*. Prior to this role, Shea served as the managing editor of *The Times-Picayune* for 19-years. At *The Times-Picayune*, Shea supervised newsroom operations, presentations, photography, and copyediting. He also played a pivotal role in the continued print and online coverage of the harrowing days after Hurricane Katrina. The reporting under Shea’s leadership led *The Times-Picayune* to win the Breaking News Pulitzer Prize in 2006.

### Article

# Daylong Efforts to Repair Levee Fail

by Dan Shea

*The Times-Picayune*, August 31, 2005

**1** New Orleans became an unimaginable scene of water, fear and suffering Tuesday after a levee breach in the 17th Street Canal sent billions of gallons of Lake Pontchartrain coursing through the city.

**2** As the day wore on, the only dry land was a narrow band from the French Quarter<sup>1</sup> and parts of Uptown, the same small strip that was settled by Bienville<sup>2</sup> amid the swamps.

**3** On Tuesday night, it appeared the city was returning to swamp when a daylong effort to shore the levee near the Hammond Highway failed. Mayor Ray Nagin said pumps were being overwhelmed and warned that a new deluge would bury the city in up to 15 feet of water.

**4** With solid water from the lake to the French Quarter, the inundation and depopulation of an entire American city was at hand.

**5** “Truth to tell, we’re not too far from filling in the bowl,” said Terry Ebbert, the city’s director of homeland security. The waters were still rising at 3 inches per hour, and eventually could move close to the French Quarter levee.

**6** Although the breach occurred on the Orleans side of the canal, it did not spare the Jefferson side. Water found its way into much of the east bank, meeting the flow that came in from the west from Hurricane Katrina’s storm surge Monday.

<sup>1</sup> The French Quarter is New Orleans’s oldest neighborhood.

<sup>2</sup> Jean-Baptiste Le Moyne de Bienville was governor of Louisiana and founder of New Orleans.

### Scaffolding the Text-Dependent Questions

**5. Which major levee breach is the focus of this article? At the time of printing, what were the plans for repairing it? How will this help rescue efforts? Reread paragraph 1. Which levee is named? Reread paragraphs 26 and 27. What does Ebbert say is to be done after rescue efforts? RI.11–12.2**

4.5

My Notes

7 An accurate tally of death was hard to determine. Five deaths related to Katrina have been confirmed in Jefferson Parish<sup>3</sup>, officials said. There also are seven people missing who decided to ride out Katrina on Grand Isle.

...

8 As to the living, with the absence of cars and electric motors in the powerless city, a sad tableau played itself out in an eerie quiet.

9 All day, a weary army of storm victims trudged through waist-deep muddy water toward the Superdome, where more than 20,000 people took refuge. The next problem is what to do with them. Late Tuesday Gov. Blanco ordered them out, saying the facility was too damaged to house people and the atmosphere too dangerous. Officials said the National Guard soon would begin driving them out to dry ground, then airlift them out of southeast Louisiana.

10 In other areas, lawlessness took hold.

11 The giant new Wal-Mart in the Lower Garden District was looted, after a limited distribution of supplies broke down in chaos. The entire gun collection was taken.

12 “There are gangs of armed men in the city moving around the city,” Ebbert said.

13 One looter shot a New Orleans police officer, who was in critical condition with a head wound.

14 Although local police focused solely on rescue, a call for help was answered by swarms of deputies from western Louisiana parishes.

15 But cops on the street, cut off from their superiors by a failure of the communications system, complained of chaos.

16 “Put this in your paper,” one officer on Canal Street said. “They told us nothing. We were unprepared. We are completely on our own.”

17 If it wasn’t coordinated, the rescue was heroic.

18 Firefighters, police and Coast Guardsmen waded through water and climbed to roofs.

19 “We’ve got boats everywhere,” said Capt. Tim Bayard of the New Orleans Police Department. “We’re going to try and get who we can get and take them to higher ground. We may have to come back for some.”

20 They were joined by an armada of Louisiana sportsmen in flat-bottomed boats, who responded to an appeal for help.

21 Ferdinand Emory rescued about 100 people, ten at a time in his boat.

22 Ebbert estimated 1,500 to 2,000 people were saved in Lakeview and Mid-City.

A woman is carried out of floodwaters after being trapped in her home after Hurricane Katrina.



<sup>3</sup> Jefferson Parish is one of 64 parishes (rather than counties) into which Louisiana is divided.

Scaffolding the Text-Dependent Questions

6. What is the implied connection between the events in paragraphs 11 and 12? Reread both paragraphs. What happened at the new Wal-Mart? What was happening in the city? What connection is unspoken between the two occurrences? [RI.11–12.1](#)

7. Summarize paragraphs 10–16. Whom does the officer blame for the chaotic rescue effort? Use details to support your inference. Reread paragraphs 15 and 16. Who are the “they” to whom the officer refers? Why does he feel that he and fellow officers are on their own? [RI.11–12.1](#), [RI.11–12.2](#)



## ACTIVITY 4.5 continued

**15** Have students jot down responses to the Making Observations so that they will be prepared to share them during class discussion.

## 4.5

### My Notes

**23** But rescue from the water didn't mean an end to misery. They were simply dropped off at the few stretches of dry ground, overpasses and parking lots along Metairie Ridge.

**24** Aleck Scallan, 63, a paraplegic, was ferried in a boat from his Lakeview home. But he had been sitting for more than six hours on an overpass, with no clear indication when he and scores of others would be picked up.

**25** Along the Metairie Road railroad embankment, the only passage through two parishes, people wandered aimlessly, along with dogs and cats that headed for high ground.

**26** After the rescue effort, the next priority is trying to heal the breach. Ebbert said plans called for giant panels to be dropped in place by helicopter, accompanied by 50, 3,000-pound sandbags. Next the Interstate 10 underpass under the railroad trestle would have to be drained, after the giant new pumping station utterly failed its first test. That would give disaster recovery teams open access to the city from the west.

**27** The failure of the Industrial Canal levee created massive flooding in St. Bernard and the 9th Ward<sup>4</sup> on Monday.

**28** Estimates on when the city would become habitable again ranged from two weeks to months.



People waded through high water in front of the Superdome August 30, 2005 in New Orleans, Louisiana, days after Hurricane Katrina.

### Making Observations

- What images come to mind while reading this article?
- What emotions do you feel after reading this article?

<sup>4</sup> The 9th Ward is the largest of 17 wards, or areas, into which New Orleans is divided.

### Scaffolding the Text-Dependent Questions

**8. Why do Aleck Scallan and others have no idea when they will be picked up from the overpass?** What is the first priority of local police? Are Scallan and those with him safe on the overpass? [RI.11–12.1](#), [RI.11–12.3](#)

### Returning to the Text

- Reread the article to answer these text-dependent questions.
- Write any additional questions you have about the text in your Reader/Writer Notebook.

5. Which major levee breach is the focus of this article? At the time of printing, what were the plans for repairing it? How will this help rescue efforts?

The article focuses on the levee breach in the 17th Street Canal. Officials plan to drop giant panels and sandbags and to drain the Interstate 10 underpass. Repairing the breach will allow recovery teams into the area, but only after rescue efforts are over.

6. What is the implied connection between the events in paragraphs 11 and 12?

The writer implies that the armed men of paragraph 11 are the looters who stole the guns from the Wal-Mart in paragraph 12 or that looters in general were stealing guns to arm themselves.

7. Summarize paragraphs 10–16. Whom does the officer blame for the chaotic rescue effort? Use details to support your inference.

Paragraphs 10–16 describe the lack of organization in New Orleans after the hurricane. In paragraph 16, the officer says, “They told us nothing... We are completely on our own.” We can infer that he is referring to his superiors, since paragraph 15 states that “cops on the streets” were “cut off from their superiors.”

8. Why do Aleck Scallan and others have no idea when they will be picked up from the overpass?

Earlier paragraphs say that local police are focused solely on rescuing people stuck in the flood by dropping them on dry land. Since Scallan and others are now on dry land, they are less of a priority than people in immediate need of rescue, despite being stranded. Also, the article states breach repair will be another key focus of first responders.

### As You Read

- Underline the priorities that President Bush mentions in his speech.
- Circle unknown words and phrases. Try to determine the meaning of the words by using context clues, word parts, or a dictionary.

**16 RETURNING TO THE TEXT:** Have students answer the text-dependent questions with their reading partners. If they have difficulty, scaffold the questions by rephrasing them or breaking them down into smaller parts. See the Scaffolding the Text-Dependent Questions boxes for suggestions.

**17** After students have analyzed the news story, engage in a brief discussion about how the article connects to any of the critical lenses they have studied. Are economic, cultural, gender, or historical elements evident in the text?

## ACTIVITY 4.5 continued

**18** Introduce the next selection by going over the As You Read, About the Author, and Academic Vocabulary box with students. Help them understand the instructions for annotation.

**19** Have students preview the photos that accompany President Bush's speech. Point out that in the second photo, President Bush is likely viewing a scene very similar to the one shown in the first photo. Ask students to tell what Bush is likely thinking and feeling, based on his expression in the photo.

**20 FIRST READ:** Because this selection is the text of a speech, you might want to read it aloud to students for the first read. Remind students that this speech was delivered by President George W. Bush on August 31, 2005, after his flight over the affected Gulf Coast area. Encourage students to pay attention to ways the text links to the critical lenses.

### TEXT COMPLEXITY

**Overall:** Moderate

**Lexile:** 1120L

**Qualitative:** Moderate Difficulty

**Task:** Moderate (Analyze)

**21** During the read-aloud, monitor student progress. Be sure students are engaged with the text and are annotating the numbers President Bush gives and the priorities he mentions.

## 4.5

### VOCABULARY

#### ACADEMIC

**Rhetorical context** refers to the subject, purpose, audience, occasion, or situation in which writing or speaking occurs.

### My Notes

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

### About the Author

George W. Bush (b. 1946) was the 43rd president of the United States. Before becoming president, Bush served as Governor of Texas from 1995–2000. His presidency was shaped by the terrorist attacks on September 11, 2001, which occurred eight months into his presidency. After his presidency, Bush founded the George W. Bush Presidential Center in Dallas, Texas and created a collection of paintings, *Portraits of Courage: A Commander in Chief's Tribute to America's Warriors*, to honor American veterans.



### Speech

## President Outlines Hurricane Katrina Relief Efforts

by President George W. Bush

August 31, 2005

**1** I've just received an update from Secretary Chertoff and other Cabinet Secretaries involved on the latest developments in Louisiana, Mississippi, and Alabama. As we flew here today, I also asked the pilot to fly over the Gulf Coast region so I could see firsthand the scope and magnitude of the devastation.

**2** The vast majority of New Orleans, Louisiana, is under water. Tens of thousands of homes and businesses are beyond repair. A lot of the Mississippi Gulf Coast has been completely destroyed. Mobile is flooded. We are dealing with one of the worst natural disasters in our nation's history.

**3** And that's why I've called the Cabinet together. The people in the affected regions expect the federal government to work with the state government and local government with an effective response. I have directed Secretary of Homeland Security Mike Chertoff to chair a Cabinet-level task force to coordinate all our assistance from Washington. FEMA<sup>5</sup> Director Mike Brown is in charge of all federal response and recovery efforts in the field. I've instructed them to work closely with state and local officials, as well as with the private sector, to ensure that we're helping, not hindering, recovery efforts. This recovery will take a long time. This recovery will take years.

**4** Our efforts are now focused on three priorities: Our first priority is to save lives. We're assisting local officials in New Orleans in evacuating any remaining citizens from the affected area. I want to thank the state of Texas, and particularly Harris County and the city of Houston and officials with the Houston Astrodome, for providing shelter to those citizens who found refuge

<sup>5</sup> The acronym FEMA stands for Federal Emergency Management Agency.

### Scaffolding the Text-Dependent Questions

**9. Based on details in the text, infer the rhetorical context of this speech.** Reread paragraphs 1–3. Where is President Bush? To whom is he speaking? What does he want to tell them? [RI.11–12.1](#), [RI.11–12.6](#)

**10. According to President Bush, what are the federal government's three priorities? How would you categorize them?** Review paragraphs 4, 8, and 10. Which priorities does he list? What examples does he give? Who or what does each priority help? [RI.11–12.1](#), [RI.11–12.2](#)



in the Super Dome in Louisiana. Buses are on the way to take those people from New Orleans to Houston.

5 FEMA has deployed more than 50 disaster medical assistance teams from all across the country to help the affected—to help those in the affected areas. FEMA has deployed more than 25 urban search and rescue teams with more than a thousand personnel to help save as many lives as possible. The United States Coast Guard is conducting search and rescue missions. They're working alongside local officials, local assets. The Coast Guard has rescued nearly 2,000 people to date.

6 The Department of Defense is deploying major assets to the region. These include the USS *Bataan* to conduct search and rescue missions; eight swift water rescue teams; the Iwo Jima Amphibious Readiness Group to help with disaster response equipment; and the hospital ship USNS *Comfort* to help provide medical care.

7 The National Guard has nearly 11,000 Guardsmen on state active duty to assist governors and local officials with security and disaster response efforts. FEMA and the Army Corps of Engineers are working around the clock with Louisiana officials to repair the breaches in the levees so we can stop the flooding in New Orleans.

8 Our second priority is to sustain lives by ensuring adequate food, water, shelter and medical supplies for survivors and dedicated citizens—dislocated citizens. FEMA is moving supplies and equipment into the hardest hit areas. The Department of Transportation has provided more than 400 trucks to move 1,000 truckloads containing 5.4 million Meals Ready to Eat—or MREs, 13.4 million liters of water, 10,400 tarps, 3.4 million pounds of ice, 144 generators, 20 containers of pre-positioned disaster supplies, 135,000 blankets and 11,000 cots. And we're just starting.

9 There are more than 78,000 people now in shelters. HHS and CDC are working with local officials to identify operating hospital facilities so we can help them, help the nurses and doctors provide necessary medical care. They're distributing medical supplies, and they're executing a public health plan to control disease and other health-related issues that might arise.

10 Our third priority is executing a comprehensive recovery effort. We're focusing on restoring power and lines of communication that have been knocked out during the storm. We'll be repairing major roads and bridges and other essential means of transportation as quickly as possible.



A U.S. Coast Guard Petty Officer and a rescue crew sent from Clearwater, Florida, look for survivors near the Louisiana bayou town of Buras.

My Notes

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

22 After the reading, have students refer back to their annotations to help them answer the Making Observation questions.

TEACHER TO TEACHER

If any of your students need support with English language development, consider differentiating instruction with the corresponding Language Workshop 4B activities available on SpringBoard Digital. Built around President Bush's speech, these activities offer a scaffolded approach to developing academic language through vocabulary study (Activity 3), guided close reading (Activity 5), and collaborative academic discussion (Activity 6). When planning differentiation, make sure to have students return to portions of the ELA activity that provide essential practice for the Embedded Assessment.

Scaffolding the Text-Dependent Questions

11. What does President Bush mean by 'major assets' in paragraph 6? What examples does he provide? What are assets? What types of assets would the Department of Defense have? Look at the examples. [RI.11-12.4](#), [RI.11-12.5](#)

## ACTIVITY 4.5 continued

23 After the reading, have students refer back to their annotations to help them answer the Making Observation questions.

## 4.5

### My Notes

11 There's a lot of work we're going to have to do. In my flyover, I saw a lot of destruction on major **infrastructure**. Repairing the infrastructure, of course, is going to be a key priority.

12 The Department of Energy is approving loans from the Strategic Petroleum Reserve to limit disruptions in crude supplies for refineries. A lot of crude production has been shut down because of the storm. I instructed Secretary Bodman to work with refiners, people who need crude oil, to alleviate any shortage through loans. The Environmental Protection Agency has granted a nationwide waiver for fuel blends to make more gasoline and diesel fuel available throughout the country. This will help take some pressure off of gas price. But our citizens must understand this storm has disrupted the capacity to make gasoline and distribute gasoline.

13 We're also developing a comprehensive plan to immediately help displaced citizens. This will include housing and education and health care and other essential needs. I've directed the folks in my Cabinet to work with local folks, local officials, to develop a comprehensive strategy to rebuild the communities affected. And there's going to be a lot of rebuilding done. I can't tell you how devastating the sights were.

14 I want to thank the communities in surrounding states that have welcomed their neighbors during an hour of need. A lot of folks left the affected areas and found refuge with a relative or a friend, and I appreciate you doing that. I also want to thank the American Red Cross and the Salvation Army and the Catholic Charities, and all other members of the armies of compassion. I think the folks in the affected areas are going to be overwhelmed when they realize how many Americans want to help them.

...

15 The folks on the Gulf Coast are going to need the help of this country for a long time. This is going to be a difficult road. The challenges that we face on the ground are unprecedented. But there's no doubt in my mind we're going to succeed. Right now the days seem awfully dark for those affected—I understand that. But I'm confident that, with time, you can get your life back in order, new communities will flourish, the great city of New Orleans will be back on its feet, and America will be a stronger place for it.



President George W. Bush looks out the window of Air Force One as he flies over New Orleans, Louisiana, surveying the damage left by Hurricane Katrina.

**infrastructure:** buildings, roads, and utility systems

### Making Observations

- What details from this speech stand out to you?
- What are your thoughts on the priorities that the President lays out in his speech?

### Scaffolding the Text-Dependent Questions

12. **What does President Bush compare charitable relief agencies to in paragraph 14? How might this comparison appeal to his audience?** What are the “armies of compassion”? What positive connotations might the words *armies* and *compassion* have for listeners? [RI.11–12.4](#), [RI.11–12.5](#), [RI.11–12.6](#)

13. **How does President Bush structure paragraph 15 to appeal to his audience?** Reread paragraph 15. Look closely at each sentence. Notice the sentences that begin with the transition word *but*. How do these sentences contrast the sentences that come before them? What effect does this create? [RI.11–12.5](#), [RI.11–12.6](#)

### Returning to the Text

- Reread the speech to answer these text-dependent questions.
- Write any additional questions you have about the text in your Reader/Writer Notebook.

9. Based on details in the text, infer the **rhetorical context** of this speech.

The president seems to be addressing the public relatively soon after Hurricane Katrina, based on the fact that he says he recently flew over the affected area. His purpose is to inform the public of the government's planned response to the disaster and to reassure the public.

10. According to President Bush, what are the federal government's three priorities? How would you categorize them?

The three priorities are "to save lives" through search and rescue, "to sustain lives" by providing necessities, and "executing a comprehensive recovery effort" to restore and rebuild the area. The first two priorities deal with helping people, while the third deals primarily with logistics.

11. What does President Bush mean by "major assets" in paragraph 6? What examples does he provide?

He means military equipment and personnel, including "the USS *Bataan* ...; eight swift water rescue teams; the Iwo Jima Amphibious Readiness Group ...; and the hospital ship USNS *Comfort*."

12. What does President Bush compare charitable relief agencies to in paragraph 14? How might this comparison appeal to his audience?

Bush calls relief agencies "the armies of compassion." This draws a figurative comparison to actual armies. This might appeal to his target audience since armies connote strength and large numbers of well-organized soldiers working toward a goal.

13. How does President Bush structure paragraph 15 to appeal to his audience?

Bush first acknowledges the audience's fears, then offers hope. For example, the first three sentences are somber, stressing the difficult recovery ahead. The fourth sentence starts with "But," to counter negative opinions. Next, he says that "the days seem awfully dark," then follows it with another *but* sentence—stressing his confidence in the future.

### 24 RETURNING TO THE TEXT:

Have students answer the text-dependent questions independently. If they have difficulty, scaffold the questions by rephrasing them or breaking them down into smaller parts. See the Scaffolding the Text-Dependent Questions boxes for suggestions.

### 25

After students have read all three texts and answered the text-dependent questions, lead a brief discussion about the connections apparent among the three texts. Guide students to consider the function of each text. Ask students to evaluate how each text's purpose may affect the choice of language and structure.

## ACTIVITY 4.5 continued

**26** Have students complete the Gaining Perspectives activity with a partner. Ask students to share their responses. Have students reference their notes and organize the class into two groups for a brief debate on the benefits and drawbacks of government involvement.

**27** Turn to the Working from the Text section. Begin by having students write a brief response to the Essential Question, as described in student step 14. Next, divide the class into numbered groups and instruct even-numbered groups to revisit the news article, while odd-numbered groups revisit President Bush's speech. Have them work through their assigned texts using the questions in student step 15. Then combine even- and odd-numbered groups to report on their analyses.

**28** Students should begin developing guiding questions for their research. Remind them to use the three bulleted points to help them structure effective guiding questions.

**29** Read aloud the description of guiding questions. Assign partners to **think-pair-share** as they work through the questions and brainstorming exercise in student step 16. Then have pairs report their observations to the rest of the class.

**30** Using the observations of the pairs of students, lead the class through the process of generating guiding questions for further investigation of Hurricane Katrina's media coverage.

# 4.5

## My Notes



## Gaining Perspectives

When a natural disaster happens, local, state, and federal governments provide disaster relief to the community; however, these events don't happen every day. With a partner, pick one topic that affects the daily lives of the people living in your community, such as education, transportation, or crime prevention. How does the government provide for your community at the local, state, and federal levels? Are there problems that are related to your topic where you think the government could be taking a more active or proactive role? What would happen if the government, at any level, wasn't involved? Summarize your discussion in your Reader/Writer Notebook.

## Working from the Text

14. Based on the texts that you've read, respond to the Essential Question: How do media sources influence our understanding of the truth and significance of an issue? Write a one-paragraph response in your Reader/Writer Notebook.
15. Revisit either the news article, "Daylong Efforts to Repair Levee Fail," or President Bush's Rose Garden address, and briefly annotate evidence that links to any of the critical lenses you have studied. Then use the following questions to analyze how the lenses might connect to bias in the text.
  - What is being reported (the who, what, where, when, why, and how of the event)?
  - How is it being reported? How objective is the coverage? Identify textual details (slanders, titles, labeling, omission, and so forth) that reveal bias.
  - Who is the target audience for the publication/broadcast? How does the text's rhetorical context affect what it talks about and its language and tone? What inferences can you draw about the writer's or speaker's expectations about the audience's perspective?
  - If you read only this article or heard only this speech, what would you think is the key issue? In other words, how does the article frame the truth and significance of the event?
  - What critical lens or lenses can be seen in how the text approaches the issue? What specific language reveals the lens(es)?

## Guiding Questions

Guiding questions are questions about a specific aspect of a topic that you can research in order to learn more about that facet of the topic and the topic as a whole. If you are writing a research paper, good guiding questions should be:

- Focused enough that it is possible for you to search for, gather, and analyze information that will give you new knowledge about a topic
- Significant enough to have been addressed in reputable research materials
- Complex enough to require in-depth research and analysis

## LEVELED DIFFERENTIATED INSTRUCTION

In this activity, students might need support completing a quickwrite prompt that confirms their understanding of critical lenses.

**Developing** Have small groups complete the **Conversation for Quickwrite** graphic organizer to identify key words to help them explain which elements from the event can be described using Historical Criticism.

**Expanding** Have student partners restate the prompt in their own words, and then choose a critical lens to focus on. Provide the **Conversation for Quickwrite** graphic organizer to help them generate and explain their ideas about what parts of the event are most relevant to that lens.

**Bridging** Have students work independently to respond to the quickwrite. Encourage them to include specific evidence from more than one of the texts in the activity.

**Support** If students have difficulty, model interpreting the first story element through one of the lenses. Then break the class into small groups and provide the **Conversation for Quickwrite** graphic organizer. Give groups time to complete part of the graphic organizer and invite volunteers to share their ideas. Use student responses to evaluate understanding and use questions to prompt clarification before having groups complete the graphic organizer.

**Extend** Ask students who need an extra challenge to lead a small group and complete the **Conversation for Quickwrite** graphic organizer. Have leaders first summarize and review the various critical lenses with their group before leading the group in completing the graphic organizer.

## My Notes

16. In preparation for further investigation of Hurricane Katrina, use guiding questions to develop focus questions to guide your research. Use the following steps and questions to narrow your thinking down to guiding questions that are more specific to what you have read about Hurricane Katrina:

- Review your understanding of the critical perspectives (archetypal, cultural, feminist, historical, Marxist, reader response). Which ones seem relevant to this topic? Why? Which ones do not? Why not?

Cultural and Historical Criticism seem central to the issue because the hurricane had major, lasting effects on the people of the region and the United States more broadly. An individual's experience of the event may have been affected by his or her status within the broader culture.

Archetypal Criticism might be relevant if the event is reported with typical story patterns (e.g., humans versus nature) or character types (e.g., the hero).

Marxist Criticism may be relevant because the event had an economic impact on people in the region and on gas prices across the country. Issues of class and economic power might play a role.

Feminist Criticism doesn't seem to be as relevant because the issue doesn't seem to involve gender issues specifically.

- Based on background knowledge and your preliminary investigation of the topic, brainstorm connections between each relevant lens and the topic.

Cultural: dominant groups and marginalized groups had different experiences of the storm; people's views on the responsibilities of local and federal government vary depending on their political ideologies; international vs. American perspectives on the event may differ

Historical: Katrina was one of the most devastating natural disasters to occur in U.S. history; lessons learned (or not learned) from previous hurricanes; conflicts taking place outside of the country at the same time; evolving perspective on Bush and criticism of his responses to national crises

Marxist: gas prices shot up in the days immediately after the storm; emergency loans kept refineries running despite disruption to crude oil supplies; economic impact of recovery; connection between residents' class status and their experience before, during, and after storm

Archetypal: humans versus nature; the hero; mass exodus

